DEA-IFAD Tripartite Portfolio Review Meeting

8th March2017, Ranchi, State of Jharkand

Summary of Discussions and Agreed Actions

1. General Observations:

The Tripartite Portfolio Review Meeting (TPRM) for IFAD assisted projects in India was held in Ranchi on 8th March, 2017. The meeting was jointly chaired by Mr. Raj Kumar, Joint Secretary (MI), DEA and Ms. Hoonae Kim, Director, Asia Pacific Regional Division, IFAD HQ. Ms Himani Pandey, Secretary, Department of Social Welfare, Government of Jharkhand and Mr Nigel Brett, Portfolio Advisor, Asia Pacific Division, IFAD HQ were also present for the review.

Opening the day's proceedings, **Ms Himani Pandey** welcomed the participants. She said that the Government of Jharkhand has been implementing a number of developmental initiatives and the TPRM will provide an opportunity for learning more from each other.

Mr Raj Kumar welcomed the project teams and the IFAD HQ Delegation. He thanked IFAD for organising the TPRM on the occasion of the International Women's Day and appreciated the work being done by IFAD for development of women and rural communities in India. He highlighted two issues where there is reasonable room for improvement at the level of the State Governments:

- High turnover of PDs in some projects which slows down project implementation: Inability to post a full time PD and frequent transfers of PD's reflects lack of ownership of projects on part of State Government.
- Despite the size of IFAD projects being small, the budget allocation by the State Finance and Line Departments is not commensurate with the project requirements, which delays implementation and disbursement.

Stressing the fact that IFAD's role as a UN Specialised Agency is different from other Multilateral Development Banks/Institutions, he advised IFAD to focus on agriculture as a way forward for rural development. IFAD's strength is in knowledge sharing and bringing best practices to the country from across the world.

Ms Hoonae Kim thanked the Government of Jharkhand for hosting the event in Ranchi and said that this was the first time she was attending a Portfolio Review in India, and looked forward to the discussions and practical solutions. Praising the tremendous achievements that India has made in the area of rural development, she said that the world is changing and India is a rising star, and among middle income countries, it has a large rural population. IFAD is a specialised agency, and the only one, which focusses on rural development. Thus IFAD looks forward to a mutually enriching association with the Government of India. She also informed the participants about the recent elections and the appointment of a new President at IFAD who will be assuming office from April 2017. Wishing participants on the occasion of International

Women's Day, she said that India has some excellent achievements in the area of women's empowerment.

Ms. Rasha Omar, Representative, IFAD India presented an overview of the IFAD portfolio in India. She made the following key points:

- The total portfolio size including IFAD loan amount and counterpart funding is more than 1 billion USD.
- There is an increasing focus in the portfolio, on farmers' adaptation to climate change and the major beneficiaries continue to be poor households, tribal communities and women.
- Compared to the previous TPRM, certain projects distinctly improved such as ILSP; but others are in the borderline category such as JTELP and OPELIP; the latter was signed a year ago and is still not grounded.
- Innovations to watch out for and monitor over the coming period include IVCS in LAMP, FPOs/ PC in ILSP and CAIM, PPP in custom hiring centres and marketing of organic products in Tejaswini.
- A key area of concern is that disbursements are stagnating and the reasons include: irregular submission of withdrawal applications; delayed release of funds as per approved AWPB by the state government; very partial release of funds as compared to approved budget; and delays in procurement.
- There are 3 distinct areas of improvements where IFAD is committed to provide implementation support: project efficiency; projects results management; knowledge sharing.

2. Specific Observations:

The specific observations discussed during the TPRM on the project performance, innovative features and agreed actions are reported below.

<u>1.</u> Tejaswini Rural Women's Empowerment Programme – Maharashtra (TRWEP MH) Loan No. 682-IN

Summary of Performance: Satisfactory project performance.

The project has achieved almost all its targets. One of the unique strengths of the project is the setting up of self-sustaining community institutions called the CMRCs. By March 2017, almost 80 %, i.e., 239 CMRC are self-sustained. They recover their operational cost through a number of sources in return for services they provide to their member SHGs such as service charge, yearly membership fee, Bank service charges for timely recovery of loan, social enterprises etc. The project has also demonstrated effectively that women are bankable and that even private sector banks are willing to invest in SHGs if they have strong internal control systems and high quality data. Cumulative saving is of Rs.462 Cr; Avg. per members saving has gone up three times during the project lifecycle; Cumulative loans provided by banks is Rs.1294.51 Cr, 86 % of eligible SHGs (45,472) with active loan of Rs. 439 cr and 82% SHGs are with repeat finances, 59% SHGs are beyond third loan cycle (above Rs. 1.50 lakhs). Tejaswini SHGs boast 98% on time recovery and less than 0.5% NPAs.

In the area of livelihoods, despite suffering from lack of fund release by the GoM, the project has been able to make significant progress primarily through convergence. Goatry, Dairy, Poultry and Agriculture are the most popular activities and the project thrust is upon changing package of practices- immunization, cattle feed, hygiene and Insurance. CMRCs have also set up 375 social enterprise activities such as agro-service centre, trading of cattle feed, goat allied activities, hatchery/poultry which provide income to the CMRCs as well as support to the livelihood activities.

The project has however been facing a resource crunch- despite its readiness to spend and ample demands at the community level, project funds have not been released on time. With 6 months remaining for the project to complete, unless the GoM releases the entire fund to the project immediately, there is a chance of a significant cancellation at closure which will reflect badly on the project and undermine its many achievements.

Innovations of national interest – Updated from last TPRM

- **Internet Sathis**, a joint initiative of MAVIM with Tata Trusts and Google is aimed at promoting digital literacy among women in rural areas. The project is now including a module on digital payments to the existing internet and digital literacy campaign. This will further strengthen the position of the Internet Saathis as "digital agents of change" in their respective area.
- **E-catering** in partnership with IRCTC was launched on 3 December 2016 by the Union Minister for Railways, This is first of its kind initiative where the CMRC/SHGs in Sawantwadi block of Sindhudurg district have been roped in by the Ministry of Railways to provide local delicious cuisine in train through e-Catering service of IRCTC.

Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
Carry out an independent evaluation of the socio- economic development model of the Tejaswini programme. The study would be used for further scaling up and replication of the model. Document the learning from Tejaswini MH to share with Tejaswini MP	Asia and Pacific Division of IFAD	May 2017
DEA to request to Chief Secretary, Govt. of Maharashtra to ensure release of the remaining funds for the project. DEA to inform the Chief Secretary that it would be difficult to consider the financing of a follow up project to GoM in case the remaining funds are not fully utilized.	follows up with	Immediate
Plan a joint event with the Ministry of Rural Development to present and disseminate the unique models of socio-economic development as well as identify the project as an Immersion centre for NRLM (similar to SERP).	IFAD ICO and MAVIM	April/ May 2017

2. Tejaswini Rural Women's Empowerment Programme – Madhya Pradesh (TRWEP-MP) Loan No. 682-IN

Summary of performance: Satisfactory project performance.

The Project has achieved many of its combined targets (under the initial loan) pertaining to

social, political and economic empowerment of women for the original loan in terms of no of SHGs/ VLCs/ Federations, no. of women elected to different positions, prevention of violence against women etc. It was on the basis of this performance that the project was given an additional financing in 2015 of nearly the same value as the original loan with additional targets for SHGs, income generation etc. Livelihoods activities have picked up in right earnest since 2016 with the appointment of a new MD. The areas where the project needs to improve quickly include: increase bank linkages for which a partnership is being worked out with NABFINS and NABKISSAN; build capacity of Federations for their sustainability; and fast tracking of livelihoods activities. TPRM noted that the capacity building of community organizations and SHGs is lagging behind the performance of the Tejaswini MH. The TPRM urged IFAD to codify the procedures that helped Tejaswini MH build strong institutions so that these can be replicated in Tejaswini MP and thus reach similar objectives in a shorter span of time.

Innovations of national interest – Updated information since last TPRM

- Project has introduced two innovative activities to address under/ malnutrition in the project areas through Saat din Saat ghar and Tiranga Thali initiatives.
- Three Federations in Tikamgarh are managing soil testing labs in partnership with the district authorities.

	Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
1.	Revise the project AWPB for FY 2017/18 so that the project focuses on core activities related to the sustainability of SHG and Federations and livelihoods activities to ensure full absorption of funds.		Immediate
2.	Engage with Tejaswini Maharashtra for strengthening of Federations and bank linkages	MD/ PD	Immediate

3. Jharkhand Tribal Empowerment & Livelihoods Project (JTELP) Loan No. 879-IN

Summary of performance: Borderline project performance. The project is in its 4th year of implementation and the disbursement rate of the IFAD loan is 14% only. The project has established the key community organizations and has implemented entry level activities in form of farm ponds. Under the thrust of the Welfare Department, the project nodal agency, JTELP PMU is intensifying the livestock based IGAs in 40 villages in the current FY. The bulk of the investments under this project, in integrated natural resources management, small-scale irrigation, and crop development, is yet to take place. The counterpart funds for this project have been released late in 4th quarter of FY 2016/17 which prevents the project from implementing its full annual work plan in a timely manner. The TPRM noted that the approach to IGA intensification was supply driven and that the project should pay attention to putting in place adequate support services, especially veterinary care and feed, biosecurity as well as organize the market linkages and, where applicable, consider value addition.

Innovations of National Interest: N/A

	Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
1.	Follow-up with MGNREGA for convergence in the implementation of the NRM activities	JTELP PMU	Immediate
2.	Welfare Dept releases the funds in a timely	Secretary, Welfare Dept	By May 2017

	manner in 2017/18.		
3.	Adequate budget is provided for veterinary services and other support services in the AWPB 2017/18	JTELP PMU	Immediate
4.	During MTR, simplify project activities, rationalize project components and re-allocate IFAD loan resources accordingly.	IFAD ICO and Welfare Dept, GoJ	July 2017
4	. Integrated Livelihood Support Programme (ILSP)	Loan No. 856-IN	
Sun	nmary of performance: Moderately satisfactory pro	ject performance.	
	fed area under crop, about 53% of the appraisal ta essing loans from financial institutions continue to be		
targ Bas with cons	et. ed on the presentation by the project, the TPRM note two years left and several outcomes yet to be achiev sider re-structuring the project.	d that this is slow m	noving project and
targ Bas with cons Inno	et. ed on the presentation by the project, the TPRM note two years left and several outcomes yet to be achiev sider re-structuring the project. • Ovations of national interest: • Not reported for this year, since the last TPRM	d that this is slow m red, IFAD and State	oving project and Government may
targ Bas with cons Inno 1.	et. ed on the presentation by the project, the TPRM note two years left and several outcomes yet to be achiev sider re-structuring the project.	d that this is slow m	oving project and Government may Timeline
targ Bas with cons Inno 1.	et. ed on the presentation by the project, the TPRM note of two years left and several outcomes yet to be achieve sider re-structuring the project. • Not reported for this year, since the last TPRM • Not reported for this year, since the last TPRM • Agreed Actions Develop a road map to achieve project outcomes and full disbursement over the next two years. Activities will be analysed and rationalized accordingly and successful ones would be retained. Milestones for the outputs/ outcomes will be identified and targets will	d that this is slow m red, IFAD and State Responsibility IFAD ICO, Rural Development Dept, ILSP PMU	oving project and Government may Timeline

completed clusters. CAIM has emerged as the biggest partner of BCI in the world, covering 75,000 farmers in six districts which has contributed in enhancing farmers' income and improving soil quality. The project has largely achieved and in some instances exceeded the planned physical outputs at design: this is notably the case the establishment of small and medium enterprises, livestock development and number of SHGs.

The absorption capacity of project has increased and the project is expected to utilize Rs 450 million (45 Crore) during 2016-17 which is 50% more than the expenditure in 2015-16. The project has made ambitious plans to utilize Rs 60-70 Crores during 2017-18 for activities to be completed by 31 December 2017. Even if the project achieves 80% of the AWPB, there will be approx. Rs.60-70 crores unspent including exchange rate gains.

Innovations of national interest: Updated information since last TPRM

- Procurement of Gir cows with high level of purity from Junagadh Agriculture University in Gujarat;
- Mushroom cultivation in Vidarbha region with buy back arrangement as an additional source of income;
- Fodder development on community land;
- Community Facility Centre for SHGs, PGs and CMRCs with facilities for processing, sorting, packaging etc;
- Tractor operated mobile shredder for cotton stalk cutting.
- Plan underway to implement digital delivery of extension during this financial year.

Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
Review AWPB 2017/18 and rationalize project components, so that a set of 4-5 high impact activities are retained and that would consolidate project performance and exit strategy		Immediate
Carry out an independent assessment of BCI	Asia and Pacific Division of IFAD	Immediate

6. Mitigating Poverty in Western Rajasthan (MPOWER) Loan No. 748-IN

Summary of performance: Moderately satisfactory project performance.

The project is in its 8th year of implementation and it has achieved most of the physical targets planned at design. MPOWER has demonstrated promising livelihoods models based on agriculture, horticulture and livestock (especially goat), where producers are supported by trained community cadres particularly in livestock care. The project presented relatively low rate of loan repayment which stand at 87% and this situation should be monitored closely to ensure full loan repayment.

Despite the additional one year extension, MPOWER is not likely to achieve the revised objectives due to HR issues (staff vacancy particularly in the districts) and the delay in renewal of FNGOs contract. It is expected that the project will not fully utilize the loan resources by the completion date and approx. 6 million USD are likely to be unutilized when the project completes in December 2017.

Innovations of national interest:

• The project is developing a prototype of custard apple processing unit and organizing

1	Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
	Review project progress, expenditures and assess the balance of loan funds that will remain unutilized	IFAD ICO	April 2017
2	Based on findings of the supervision mission, IFAD ICO to consult DEA regarding appropriate action for the unutilized loan amount.	IFAD ICO and DEA	May 2017
3	IFAD ICO to support the project in the completion process	IFAD ICO	May onwards
<u>7.</u> Su	Post-Tsunami Sustainable Livelihoods Programme Nadu (PTSLP) Loan No. 662-IN, 691-IN and Additional Immary of performance: Moderately satisfactory proj	loan no 200000143:	3
sh Th su als vu rea no i.e	overnment Order and the Rural Development Dept is r ould be issued by 15 th March 2017. e project has achieved most of its physical outputs ccessful in promoting enterprises in the area of fishing so provided a number of innovative financial tools Inerability and reduced the fishers reliance on the mo ached 78% of the planned target. The recent supervisited continued decline in the performance of the core co ., SHG, Panchayat Level Federations, and Fish Marketing novations of national interest : New from last TPRM • Assets insurance for the fishermen covering loss of	as per project des , farming and off-fa that have reduce oneylenders. Insura sion mission in Feb ommunity organization g Societies.	sign. It has bee rm sectors. It ha d the househol nce products ha ruary/March 201 ons of the projec
	calamities in the sea.	-	1
	Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
4	Dresses the regularity of lass is allocation of lass	IFAD ICO	Income a di ata
1	Process the request for re-allocation of loan proceeds across categories for loan 691-IN		Immediate
1 2	Process the request for re-allocation of loan proceeds across categories for loan 691-IN Rural Development Dept to issue Government Order (GO) for the expansion to 6 new districts by 15 th March 2017	PMU to follow-up	Immediate Immediate

Summary of performance: The entry into force of the project was declared on 18th March 2016. The project staff is in place since August/ September 2016 at the PMU level; The MPA complementary staff for project implementation are yet to be recruited; the Project Implementation Manual was finalized in August 2016 but not yet cleared by the Finance Dept at state level; the recruitment of facilitating NGOs that would implement project activities at community level is still on-going. No project activities were implemented on the ground till date. The initial deposit was disbursed and this represents 6% of the loan amount. The main expenditure to date consists in the transfer of 2.8 Crore INR to the 17 MPAs. The TPRM noted that the work plan for 2017/18 was not presented with a clear timeline.

The TPRW holed that the work plan for 2017/16 was not presented with a clea

Innovations of national interest: N/A

• No innovations to report at present.

	Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
1.	Carry out a detailed planning of the project start-up activities and revise the AWPB 2017/ 18 so that activities are properly sequenced, with clear timeline and costs	PMU OPELIP	Immediate
2.	DEA will raise the concern of the slow progress of the project with Govt. of Odisha and urge to take appropriate action to improve project management and speed up the implementation	DEA	Immediate
3.	OPELIP PMU to prepare a concrete timeline for recruitment of MPA staffs.	PMU, OPELIP	Immediate
	Meghalaya Livelihoods and Access to Mar No.2000000648	ket Project (Meg	ha-LAMP) Loar
seco ann and	nmary of performance: Moderately satisfactory pro- ond year of implementation and the rate of disbursem ual expenditure so far is INR 70 million which is far sh this despite the project completing all required nagement is confident they would be able to spend abo	ent of IFAD loan sta nort of the AWPB of preparatory activiti	nds at 3.4 %. The INR 984.4 million es. The projec

The project presented an ÁWPB 2017/18 where 75% of the costs are taken up by road construction. The TPRM noted that such a work plan may deviate the project from its initial objective of demonstrating the development of production and marketing clusters, promotion of enterprises and enhancing access to markets. Moreover, road construction and rehabilitation is better addressed by other Government initiatives such as the public works programme and MGNREGA. The TPRM also reiterated that the project should submit the audit report before 31 March 2017 otherwise the loan disbursement would be suspended. Finally, the TPRM appreciated the importance the project gives to knowledge management.

Innovations of national interest:

 EFCs are a one-stop-shop for enterprise development where interested entrepreneurs get access to bank, convergence and project funding, along with advice, training and technical support. Based on evaluation of its performance the project has now restructured it to form LINKS- Livelihoods Incubation Kendras for expanding outreach of enterprise development services.

Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline	

1	Submission of the audit report 2015/16 by 17 March 2017 at the latest.	PD/ APD	No later than 17 March 2017
2	Revise the AWPB 2017/18 to focus on the core activities of the project and reduce excessive focus on road construction	PD/APD	Immediate

10. North Eastern Region Community Resource Management Project for Upland Areas (NERCORMP) Loan No. 794-IN

Summary of Performance: Very satisfactory project performance.

The TPRM was pleased with the achievements of NERCORMP II and the project developed a successful model based on empowering women and men, creating representative and self-financing institutions, converging with Government programmes, and monitoring the results. It is clear that what matters in the IFAD supported projects is the soundness of socio-economic development models proposed and their replicability, irrespective of the size of the project. The NEC and IFAD should be able to identify now the most effective strategy based on lessons learned, for poverty reduction, social and economic empowerment and sustainable management of natural resources. The TPRM also recognized that the continuity of the project management and leadership and regularity in fund release contributed greatly to project results. It is worth noting that an amount of USD 1.56 million will be unutilized at project closing.

Innovations of national interest -

 Participatory approach, inclusive CBOs, women development through micro-credits, jhum land development, new enterprises among rural tribal communities, etc. are some of the innovations outlined in the draft PCR. The project will be documenting all the innovations as part of the Project Completion Report.

	Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
1.	NERCORMP to submit the PCR ¹	PMU	Immediate
_			

11. Andhra Pradesh Drought Mitigation Project (APDMP) Loan No. 2000001749

Summary of Performance: The project is not yet effective

The project presentation focused on the start-up activities to get the project grounded before the forthcoming kharif season. Start-up activities were presented with a set timeline. The results framework of the project centered around increase in assets and incomes of households thanks to the integration of livestock in the farming system and expansion of the number of farmers using protective irrigation. The key elements of the AWPB 2017/18 were also presented with priority given to the set-up of the climate information centers, the extension activities for crop diversification as well as soil/ water management, and the expansion of protective irrigation in the first 110 clusters.

The participation in the TPRM was also an opportunity for APDMP to be exposed to other

¹ NERCORMP has submitted its PCR on 10th March; the project is also planning to organise a regional learning and knowledge sharing event in May-June 2017.

projects' experiences. Main lessons learned are: the work plan should be focused on a smaller number of activities and conducted in a high level of intensification; draw on the experiences of other projects in FPO formation, market linkages and value addition; ensuring that the ultra-poor households benefit from project activities; monitoring project effects in participating and non-participating villages for comparison purposes and better assessment of project impact. The TPRM congratulated the project team for the preparedness and mobilization of resources for an effective project start-up.

Innovations of national interest -

• The State of Andhra Pradesh intends to convert the climate information centers into one stop shop for agricultural inputs and machinery services.

	Agreed Actions	Responsibility	Timeline
1.	Adhere to timeline of start-up activities		Immediate
		Agriculture, Govt.	
		of AP and IFAD	

List of Participants

Department of Economic Affairs, Ministry of Finance

- 1. Mr. Raj Kumar, Joint Secretary (MI)
- 2. Mr. Rishikesh Singh, Director (MI)
- 3. Mr. Anand Singh, Senior Accounts Officer, Office of CAA&A

Govt of Jharkhand

- 4. Ms Himani Pandey IAS, Secretary, Welfare Dept., Jharkhand
- 5. Mr. Harsh Mangla IAS, Jt Secretary, Welfare Dept, Jharkhand

IFAD

- 6. Ms. Hoonae Kim, Director, Asia and Pacific Division, IFAD HQ in Rome
- 7. Mr. Nigel Brett, Lead Portfolio Advisor, Asia and Pacific Division, IFAD HQ in Rome
- 8. Ms. Rasha Omar, Country Programme Manager / Country Representative, IFAD India Country Office
- 9. Ms. Meera Mishra, Country Coordinator, IFAD India Country Office
- 10. Mr. Vincent Darlong, Country Programme Officer, IFAD India Country Office
- 11. Mr. Sankarasubramaniam Sriram, Programme Support Analyst, IFAD India Country Office

Project Authorities

- 12. Mr. Rajeev Singhal, ILSP, Uttarakhand
- 13. Mr. S.M. Sahay, DyCEO, LAMP/MBDA, Shillong, Meghalaya
- 14. Mr. Jun Momin, OSD, LAMP/MBDA, Shillong, Meghalaya
- 15. Mr. Jaipal Singh Mertia, PD, MPOWER, Jodhpur
- 16. Mr. B.K. Dwivedi, Dy Dir, PMU, MPOWER, Jodhpur, Rajasthan
- 17. Mr. Kishan Lal Chauhan, Account Officer, MPOWER, Jodhpur
- 18. Ms. Indra Mallo, IAS, MD, MAVIM & Tejaswini Maharashtra, Mumbai, Maharashtra
- 19. Ms. Gauri Donde, MAVIM/ Tejaswini Maharashtra, Mumbai.
- 20. Ms. Seema Singh, PD, Tejaswini MP, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh
- 21. Mr. Chaturvedi, Deputy Programme Director, Tejaswini Madhya Pradesh
- 22. Mr. Adrian Marbaniang, Director (M&E), NERCORMP, Shillong, Meghalaya
- 23. Mr. D Nath, Director (Finance), NERCORMP Shillong, Meghalaya
- 24. Mr. L. Raja, Addl PD, PTSLP, Tamil Nadu
- 25. Mr. Dipti Ranjan Gantayat, PO, OPELIP
- 26. Mr. Ganesh Chaudhari, PD, CAIM, Amravati, Maharashtra
- 27. Mr. Ramana, Asstt Director, Agriculture & APDMP, Vizakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh
- 28. Mr. Bhujendra Baski, SPD, JTELP, Ranchi
- 29. Mr. Manoj Sinha, APD, JTELP, Ranchi
- 30. Mr. Anjan Kr Verma, Manager Finance & Admin
- 31. Mr. Ramesh Shankar Prasad, Manager, Livelihood & KM, JTELP
- 32. Mr. D. Kundu, Manager, M&E
- 33. Mr. Niraj Kr Singh, Manager NRM
- 34. Mr. Ved Prakash Srivastava, Manager Convergence
- 35. Ms. Ranjana Topno, Manager Gender